



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 7, 2009
State Treasurers' Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The January 7, 2009 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Maxine J. McClelland, Member (arrived at 9:45 a.m.)
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the November 13, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the State Assessors Board Course 1 instructor evaluations.
2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve 4.5 hours of elective educational renewal credit for a Michigan Municipal League seminar titled "Geographic Information for Michigan Communities—Building the National Spatial Data".
3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Ms. Beth M. Botke, Ms. Deborah B. Koehn, Ms. Jo Anna L. LaGow, Ms. Wendy D. Loshaw, Mr. Michael W. Markes, Ms. Cheryl M. O'Connor, Ms. Caryn L. Rasch, and Mr. Samuel C. Spang.

CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant the certification reinstatement request of Ms. Margaret Esterline for 2008 contingent upon Ms. Esterline paying the same penalties that are prescribed in the Board's late renewal session completions policy/procedure.
2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the multiple unit certification level changes policy/procedure as presented.

3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant a unit requirements waiver for Frenchtown Township, Monroe County, for 2009 based on a level 4 assessing officer having responsibility for assessing the power plant property that causes the Township to exceed the commercial/industrial state equalized value limit stated in the level 4 unit requirements.

4. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant a unit requirements waiver for Mason County for 2009 based on a level 4 assessing officer having responsibility for assessing the power plant property that causes the County to exceed the state equalized value limits stated in the level 4 unit requirements.

5. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant a unit requirements waiver for Bingham Township, Huron County, for 2009 based on a level 3 assessing officer having responsibility for assessing the wind turbine property that causes the Township to exceed the state equalized value limits stated in the level 1 unit requirements.

6. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to approve the 2010 unit level requirements which were determined using the statewide change in state equalized value from 2006 to 2008.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

Certification Applicants December 23, 2008

Level 1

Bowden, Brian E.
Mattson, Fay L.

Morgan, Joshua P.
Paille, Richard R.

Zaremski, Lois A.

Level 2

Anderson, Tramaine
Bell, April G.
Bowden, Brian E.
Couretas, Karen
Davenport, Terry
DeWachter, Katherine
Eliopulos, Peter W.

Erhart, Mark
Ericson, Charles
Fedio, James E.
Foley, Tina L.
Larkins, Donald K.
Martin, Michael J.
Miller, Kimberly

Morgan, Joshua P.
Purtell-Stauffer, Jamie
Sabbath, Keri S.
Schultz, Sharon A.
Vlad, Elena T.
Yingling, Jennifer D.

Level 3

Lupi, Ronald D.
Ortiz, Anthony M.

Slepski, Leonard R.
Steigerwald, Paul

Yoakam, Jason M.

Level 4

Duford, Reid A.

**Certification Totals
December 23, 2008**

Level 1	549
Level 2	948
Level 3	894
Level 4	<u>147</u>
Total	2,538

2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to grant conditional certification to Mr. Peter Brock for Masonville Township, Delta County.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS FOR 2009: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved for Hobart to continue to serve as Chairperson for 2009. It was moved by Hobart, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved for Patel to continue to serve as Vice Chairperson for 2009.

CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(a) and 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from November 13, 2008
2. Discussion of official revocation order relating to revocation petition 08-0025
3. Discussion of official suspension order relating to revocation petition 08-0027
4. Formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0028
5. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0035
6. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0036

MEETING RECESS: The meeting recessed at 12:00 p.m. for lunch. The meeting reconvened at 1:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Maxine J. McClelland, Member
Frederick W. Morgan, Member

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

7. Informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0039

8. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0040
9. Discussion of a certification reinstatement request
10. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0020
11. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0021
12. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0029
13. Discussion of findings from the State Tax Commission's Reviews of Local Unit Assessment Administration Practices, Procedures and Records (i.e., "mini-reviews")
14. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P951 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for January 7, 2009)
15. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P1003 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for January 7, 2009)
16. Discussion of an assessing practices matter (the matter starting on page P1039 of the Board's closed meeting agenda packet for January 7, 2009)
17. Discussion of a level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request
18. Discussion of November 2008 course examination results
19. Discussion of narrative appraisal 205
20. Discussion of a proposed quiz for the mandatory renewal program titled "Application of New, Loss, Additions, Losses, and Adjustment"

A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Morgan—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the closed meeting minutes of November 13, 2008 as presented.
2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the official revocation order as presented for revocation petition 08-0025.
3. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the official suspension order as presented for revocation petition 08-0027.
4. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved (Morgan recused himself) to suspend the certification of the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0028 for two years and pending completion of certain educational requirements (a principles of appraisal course, a personal property course, a land valuation course, and the three mandatory

State Assessors Board six-hour renewal programs) and to have the assessing officer appear before the Board to be able to regain normal certification status.

5. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to hold revocation petition 08-0035 in abeyance until July 31, 2009.

6. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to ask Assessment and Certification Division staff to review the land value and economic condition factor determinations, if any, the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0036 performed and to hold the informal revocation hearing in abeyance until February 13, 2009.

7. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold revocation petition 08-0039 in abeyance to allow the Executive Secretary to obtain the reappraisal or revaluation contract between the assessing officer named in the petition and the local unit involved.

8. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0040.

- 9. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to reinstate the certification of the assessing officer named in revocation petition 95-0014, require the assessing officer to complete certain training (BS&A Software, Level I—Program Introduction and Setup; BS&A Software, Level II—Assessment Roll and Data Entry; State Assessors Board Course 1 and Course 2; and a property tax law and exemptions course), and ask the Assessment and Certification Division to provide quarterly progress reports on the assessing officer's work.

10. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved (Hobart recused herself) to dismiss revocation petition 08-0020 and to include a warning regarding the proper assessment of improvements in licensed mobile home parks in the letter notifying the assessing officer named in the petition of the dismissal.

11. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0021.

12. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold a formal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0029.

13. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved (1) to commence revocation proceedings on the Board's own initiative against the assessing officers who did not provide accurate information on the certification statements associated with the State Tax Commission's Reviews of Local Unit Assessment Administration Practices, Procedures and Records (i.e., "mini-reviews") and (2) to ask those assessing officers to provide specific written responses regarding the lack of accuracy in the certification statements.

14. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative with regard to the assessing practices matter starting on page P951 of the Board's January 7, 2009 closed meeting agenda packet and to ask the assessing officer involved to respond in writing to the petition.

15. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Morgan, and unanimously approved to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative with regard to the assessing practices matter starting on page P1003 of the Board's January 7, 2009 closed meeting agenda packet and to hold an informal revocation hearing for the assessing officer involved.

16. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to commence a revocation proceeding on the Board's own initiative with regard to the assessing practices matter starting on page P1039 of the Board's January 7, 2009 closed meeting agenda packet, to advise the assessing officer involved to attend a Board of Review training session, and to hold the petition in abeyance until April of 2009.

17. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the level 4 demonstration appraisal subject property request and to provide appropriate cautions to the level 4 candidate.

18. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the November 2008 course examination results.

19. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the grader's failing grade for narrative appraisal 205.

20. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the quiz for the mandatory renewal program titled "Application of New, Loss, Additions, Losses, and Adjustment" and to authorize the Executive Secretary to modify the quiz as needed.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. The need for changes to the 2009 State Assessors Board meeting schedule was discussed.

2. It was moved by Morgan, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve a certificate of appreciation for Ms. Vicki E. Riedel for her many contributions to the assessing profession.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for February 13, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the State Treasurers' Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 2:50 p.m.

Date minutes typed: January 20, 2009

Date minutes approved: 2-13-09



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson